

**REPORT TO THE
LOUISIANA BOARD OF REGENTS**

**RECRUITMENT OF SUPERIOR GRADUATE STUDENTS COMPONENT
OF THE
BOARD OF REGENTS SUPPORT FUND
FY 2012-13 COMPETITION FOR AWARDS TO BEGIN IN FY 2014-15**

**Dr. John Mayfield, Chair
Professor
Iowa State University**

**Dr. Charles Ambler
Former Dean of the Graduate School
University of Texas at El Paso**

**Dr. Roger Chalkley
Senior Associate Dean for Biomedical Research Education and Training
Vanderbilt University Medical School**

**Dr. Suzanne Ortega
Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs
University of North Carolina**

INTRODUCTION

The panel urges applicants to read the summary critiques, included in this report, relating to each submitted proposal. Most summaries offer specific suggestions to help applicants design proposals for future competitions of the Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students Program.

The review panel for the Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students Program met in Baton Rouge on February 23 and 24, 2013 to discuss and make funding recommendations relative to proposals submitted in the FY 2012-13 competition for awards to begin in FY 2014-15. Members of the panel were Dr. John Mayfield (Chair), Iowa State University; Dr. Roger Chalkley, Vanderbilt University Medical School; Dr. Charles Ambler, University of Texas at El Paso; and Dr. Suzanne Ortega, University of North Carolina.

Nine (9) institutions submitted a total of thirty-one (31) proposals within the disciplines eligible for this year's competition in the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program. One (1) university submitted a total of one (1) proposal in the Graduate Fellowships for Teachers Program. In some cases two or more departments within an academic unit submitted a single proposal.

Prior to arriving in Baton Rouge, consultants individually read and evaluated each proposal according to the guidelines provided by the Louisiana Board of Regents in the FY 2012-13 Graduate Fellows Request for Proposals. Each consultant assigned a preliminary rating to each proposal before the February meeting. Preliminary composite scores were then computed and facilitated discussions at the panel meeting.

After thorough assessment of the merits of each proposal, the consultants established a rank order for all of the proposals and recommended monetary levels for awards according to established criteria. Recommendations were made consistent with the limits of available funding as determined by the Board of Regents. Final composite scores assigned to the proposals ranged from 66 to 85 out of a maximum of 100. The panel did not recommend funding for those proposals receiving scores of less than 75. A total of \$899,500 in first-year monies was recommended for expenditure.

The total amount of first-year funds requested in the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program was \$2,582,000. The Graduate Fellowships for Teachers proposal requested first-year funds of \$120,000. Consultants were advised that \$720,000 was allocated for the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program and \$180,000 for the Graduate Fellowships for Teachers Program. The panel was also advised that any funds not committed to proposals submitted for the latter program should be recommended for expenditure under the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program, assuming that a sufficient number of meritorious proposals had been submitted in Traditional GF to warrant the transfer.

The panel recommends that twenty (20) of the thirty-one (31) proposals submitted under the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program be funded in the amounts specified in Appendix A; the single proposal submitted under the Graduate Fellowships for Teachers Program is also recommended for funding. Appendix B consists of brief narrative summaries of the panel's assessment of each proposal and Appendix C contains a listing of all proposals submitted under each program.

The cumulative requests substantially exceed the total amount of funding available. Panel members made every effort to keep recommendations within established funding limitations as well as in accordance with the collective assessment of each proposal's individual merits. Reviewers sought to ascertain the degree to which each award could bring about the successful recruitment of superior graduate students. Such efforts are consistent with the goal of enhancing the overall quality of higher education in and the social, cultural and economic development of Louisiana. Moreover, panel members considered in each case whether the dollar

value of the requested fellowship stipend would ensure each program's competitiveness with comparable institutions and accord with past recruiting efforts.

Once again, the four panel members commend all involved in this ongoing endeavor to elevate the level of graduate study in Louisiana's institutions of higher education. The members of the panel, collectively and individually, also wish to express their appreciation to the staff of the Louisiana Board of Regents for their aid and support in the completion of this task.

Panel Comments, Recommendations and Suggestions:

1. Applicants must complete the required tables correctly. Though data reporting has improved in recent cycles, there continue to be mistakes, omissions, and misinterpretations of the data requested. Incomplete or error-filled data tables can have serious consequences in panel deliberations. These data are very important to the panel's understanding of graduate programs' strengths and challenges.
2. The panel relies heavily on and carefully analyzes the data in the required tables. If data suggest problems with recruitment, retention, time to degree, minority participation, or other elements of a graduate program, the proposal should specifically address the problem(s) in the narrative and indicate what the program is doing or will do to respond. For example, if large numbers of students leave without the intended degree, explain this trend.
3. Recruitment plans that have been in place for many years and are not yielding results, particularly those related to increasing enrollment of under-represented minority students, should be reevaluated. This panel sometimes sees the same proposals putting forth the same plans with the same results year after year and wonders why plans do not evolve or change, particularly when performance is stagnant or in decline. Convincing proposals will include an evaluation of what has worked, what has not and what concrete changes are proposed to address deficiencies.
4. Proposals are enhanced by the inclusion of clear and systematic mentoring plans coupled with meaningful benchmarks and timelines for satisfactory progress. Descriptions of resources available to students who fall behind or fail to meet benchmarks should be included in addition to the statements describing penalties. The panel would like proposals to specify how mentoring procedures put in place for Board of Regents fellowship recipients have impacted the quality of mentoring for all students in the graduate program. The panel notes that the current section on Mentoring and Tracking is not well addressed in most proposals.
5. Student outcomes following completion of the degree are an extremely important measure of a graduate program's success, and proposals are significantly enhanced by the inclusion of quantitative data on the placement of program graduates. This data should be summarized systematically rather than presented anecdotally in the proposals.
6. Economic development is very important to the Board of Regents Support Fund and to the Graduate Fellows panel. Most proposals can be improved by providing specific examples in addition to generalities in their descriptions of economic development success and/or potential.

7. Programs that have received fellowship funding for many years should document how those fellowships have enhanced the quality of programs and led to the recruitment of talented and diverse graduate students.
8. Though the terms of BoRSF fellowships (two years for academic master's, three years for professional master's, and four years for doctoral studies) are insufficient for most students to complete their studies, many proposals do not address the issue of funding for fellowship recipients after Board support concludes. Proposals can be enhanced by including plans or pledges regarding the level and duration of support after conclusion of the BoRSF fellowship.
9. Though this has improved in recent years, the panel notes that a few proposals still provide names and personal information for students in and graduates of programs seeking funding. **This practice is inappropriate and does not strengthen the proposal in any way.** Applicants are urged to maintain the anonymity of students.
10. Though ETS guidelines clearly state that use of composite GRE scores is a misuse of test results and the panel has for several years urged applicants to provide only the scores most relevant to the graduate program for which funding is sought, a handful of proposals continue to provide composite scores. ETS's most recent comments on use of scores may be found at http://www.ets.org/s/gre/pdf/gre_guide.pdf. As in several recent competitions, this year the use of combined scores resulted in substantially reduced scoring by the reviewers.
11. There has been great improvement in proper use of the term "under-represented minority". The panel still reminds applicants that Asian Americans and non-citizens who do not have permanent resident status are not to be categorized as under-represented in this competition. The panel continues to note a surprising number of Pacific Islanders and Native Alaskans cited as enrolled in Louisiana graduate programs and urges applicants to make certain that these students are appropriately listed as members of these ethnic categories.
12. Applicants are strongly discouraged from including appendices, which are rarely used by the review panel because they are generally over-filled and difficult to navigate. Material should be provided in appendices only when it specifically illustrates or documents points made in the proposal narrative.

APPENDIX A

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUNDING

**LOUISIANA BOARD OF REGENTS SUPPORT FUND
TRADITIONAL GRADUATE FELLOWS AND GRADUATE FELLOWSHIPS FOR TEACHERS PROGRAMS
FY 2012-14 CYCLE FOR AWARDS TO BEGIN IN FY 2014-15**

**TABLE I
PROPOSALS RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING**

RANK	PROPOSAL NO.	INSTITUTION	DISCIPLINE	LENGTH/TYPE OF PROGRAM	NUMBER OF FELLOWSHIPS RECOMMENDED	ANNUAL STIPEND AMOUNT	YEAR	TOTAL BORSF MONEY RECOMMENDED	CUMULATIVE AMOUNT OF 1ST YEAR AWARDS
1	008GF-14	LSU-BR	CHEMISTRY	4 YR. DOC	2	\$30,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 60,000 \$ 60,000 \$ 60,000 <u>\$ 60,000</u> \$240,000	\$60,000
2	011GF-14	LSU-BR	ENGINEERING	4 YR. DOC	3	\$30,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 90,000 \$ 90,000 \$ 90,000 <u>\$ 90,000</u> \$360,000	\$150,000
3	001GF-14	LSU-BR	MATHEMATICS	4 YR. DOC	2	\$27,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 54,000 \$ 54,000 \$ 54,000 <u>\$ 54,000</u> \$216,000	\$204,000
4	013GF-14	LA TECH	ENGINEERING	4 YR. DOC	3	\$25,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 75,000 \$ 75,000 \$ 75,000 <u>\$ 75,000</u> \$300,000	\$279,000
5	020GF-14	TULANE	CHEMISTRY	4 YR. DOC	2	\$30,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 60,000 \$ 60,000 \$ 60,000 <u>\$ 60,000</u> \$240,000	\$339,000
6	022GF-14	TULANE	HEALTH & MEDICAL	4 YR. DOC	2	\$28,500	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 57,000 \$ 57,000 \$ 57,000 <u>\$ 57,000</u> \$228,000	\$396,000
7	010GF-14	LSU-BR	EARTH & ENVIRONMENTAL	4 YR. DOC 2 YR. MASTER'S	1 1	\$28,000 \$24,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 52,000 \$ 52,000 \$ 28,000 <u>\$ 28,000</u> \$160,000	\$448,000

RANK	PROPOSAL NO.	INSTITUTION	DISCIPLINE	LENGTH/TYPE OF PROGRAM	NUMBER OF FELLOWSHIPS RECOMMENDED	ANNUAL STIPEND AMOUNT	YEAR	TOTAL BORSF MONEY RECOMMENDED	CUMULATIVE AMOUNT OF 1ST YEAR AWARDS
8	018GF-14	TULANE	BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES	4 YR. DOC	1	\$30,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 <u>\$ 30,000</u> \$120,000	\$478,000
9	017GF-14	TULANE	EARTH & ENVIRONMENTAL	4 YR. DOC	1	\$25,500	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 25,500 \$ 25,500 \$ 25,500 <u>\$ 25,500</u> \$102,000	\$503,500
10	028GF-14	UL LAFAYETTE	BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES	4 YR. DOC	1	\$28,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 28,000 \$ 28,000 \$ 28,000 <u>\$ 28,000</u> \$112,000	\$531,500
11	024GF-14	TUHSC	BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES	4 YR. DOC	1	\$28,500	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 28,500 \$ 28,500 \$ 28,500 <u>\$ 28,500</u> \$114,000	\$560,000
12	012GF-14	LSUHSCNO	BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES	4 YR. DOC	1	\$27,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 27,000 \$ 27,000 \$ 27,000 <u>\$ 27,000</u> \$108,000	\$587,000
13	019GF-14	TULANE	ENGINEERING	4 YR. DOC	1	\$30,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 <u>\$ 30,000</u> \$120,000	\$617,000
14	014GF-14	LA TECH	MATHEMATICS	4 YR. DOC	1	\$25,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 25,000 \$ 25,000 \$ 25,000 <u>\$ 25,000</u> \$100,000	\$642,000
15	023GF-14	TUHSC	HEALTH & MEDICAL	4 YR. DOC	1	\$28,500	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 28,500 \$ 28,500 \$ 28,500 <u>\$ 28,500</u> \$114,000	\$670,500

RANK	PROPOSAL NO.	INSTITUTION	DISCIPLINE	LENGTH/TYPE OF PROGRAM	NUMBER OF FELLOWSHIPS RECOMMENDED	ANNUAL STIPEND AMOUNT	YEAR	TOTAL BORSF MONEY RECOMMENDED	CUMULATIVE AMOUNT OF 1 ST YEAR AWARDS
16	030GF-14	UNO	BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES	4 YR. DOC	1	\$30,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 <u>\$ 30,000</u> \$120,000	\$700,500
17	006GF-14	LSU-BR	BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES	4 YR. DOC	1	\$30,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 <u>\$ 30,000</u> \$120,000	\$730,500
18	031GF-14	UNO	CHEMISTRY	4 YR. DOC	1	\$30,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 \$ 30,000 <u>\$ 30,000</u> \$120,000	\$760,500
19	015GF-14	NICHOLLS	BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES	2 YR. MASTER'S	2	\$15,000	Year 1 Year 2 TOTAL	\$ 30,000 <u>\$ 30,000</u> \$ 60,000	\$790,500
20	002GF-14	LSU-BR	PHYSICS & ASTRONOMY	4 YR. DOC	1	\$29,000	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 TOTAL	\$ 29,000 \$ 29,000 \$ 29,000 <u>\$ 29,000</u> \$116,000	\$819,500
1	001GFT-14	LSU-BR	MATH & SCIENCE EDUCATION	1 YR. MASTER'S	4	\$20,000	Year 1 TOTAL	<u>\$ 80,000</u> \$ 80,000	\$899,500

**TABLE II
PROPOSALS NOT RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING**

PROPOSAL NO.	INSTITUTION	ELIGIBLE DISCIPLINE
003GF-14	LSU-BR	EDUCATION
004GF-14	LSU-BR	AGRICULTURE
005GF-14	LSU-BR	BUSINESS
007GF-14	LSU-BR	COMPUTER & INFORMATION SCIENCES
009GF-14	LSU-BR	HEALTH & MEDICAL SCIENCES
016GF-14	SUBR	MATHEMATICS
021GF-14	TULANE	PHYSICS & ASTRONOMY
025GF-14	UL LAFAYETTE	COMPUTER & INFORMATION SCIENCES
026GF-14	UL LAFAYETTE	ENGINEERING
027GF-14	UL LAFAYETTE	HEALTH & MEDICAL
029GF-14	UL LAFAYETTE	MATHEMATICS

APPENDIX B

NARRATIVE ASSESSMENTS

**COMMENTS ON PROPOSALS SUBMITTED UNDER THE BOARD OF REGENTS
SUPPORT FUND PROGRAMS FOR TRADITIONAL GRADUATE FELLOWS AND
GRADUATE FELLOWSHIPS FOR TEACHERS**

**001GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Recruitment of Superior Doctoral Students in Mathematics”
Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years**

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years = \$216,000 TOTAL

The LSU Mathematics Department has a strong faculty and a vigorous Ph.D. program. Somewhat troubling is the high dropout rate (two dropouts for every three graduations). The high ratio of admissions/applications together with low acceptance rate and the high dropout rate suggests that too many students are admitted who cannot complete the program. This problem seems less severe for BoRSF fellows, suggesting that carefully selected students fare better. It would be interesting to see the department’s experience with students recruited under the VIGRE and GANN grants. The recruitment of minorities is adequate, but could be improved. The direct benefits of the program and its graduates to the economic development of Louisiana should be more strongly articulated; the recent emphasis on applied math should have an economic impact and could add evidence to the proposal’s argument. The \$5,000 institutional match for each fellowship is a very positive addition. Funding is recommended for two four-year doctoral fellowships at \$27,000 each per year.

**002GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Graduate Fellows in Physics and Astronomy”
Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$29,000/annum for 4 years**

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$29,000/annum for 4 years = \$116,000 TOTAL

LSU’s Physics Department is one of the largest and strongest on the campus, with excellent external grant support and a long and successful history of graduate student training. The ratio of research assistants to teaching assistants is healthy, indicative of adequate grant funding to support the graduate program. That the Ph.D. program is growing, with increasing test scores and GPAs among matriculants, also indicates a healthy funding environment and a positive reputation. The impact of the department on the State’s economy is not well argued and should be much more persuasive. Minority recruitment is poor. Overall it is clear that this is a solid program that benefits Louisiana, but the case for how BoRSF fellowships would make a significant difference to departmental quality or recruitment should be made more strongly. The Medical Physics program seems to be thriving. The panel applauds the \$3,000 match for fellowship stipends, which should help to attract truly superior students. Funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$29,000 per year.

**003GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Early childhood graduate fellowship: Investigating teacher-child language in preschool centers”
Requested: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$25,000/annum for 4 years**

Recommended: - 0 -

The Early Childhood program, housed within the School of Education at LSU and A&M College, has recently benefited from a reorganization that brings two additional research-active faculty members into the unit. With the addition of these new faculty members, the program is poised to expand its research presence and the size of its doctoral program. The proposal does an excellent job of documenting the economic return on dollars invested in early childhood research. The proposal also documents how research will inform and improve the practice of teaching throughout Louisiana by the encouragement of child language development. While the proposal makes a clear case for the importance of the research agenda, it focuses almost entirely on how additional doctoral students will benefit the faculty research agenda and pays almost no attention to how students will be mentored, recruited, and prepared for future careers. Further, data included in the various tables do not break out the number of applicants applying to the Early Childhood track. The proposal narrative suggests that the number of applicants to the Early Childhood program is small, which makes the lack of information on exactly how new students,

particularly those from under-represented groups, will be recruited even more troubling. The proposal seems to be seeking support for a research assistant for the principal investigator, which is not aligned with the objectives and intent of the Graduate Fellows program. No funding is recommended.

004GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Recruitment of Superior Doctoral Students in Rural and Coastal Resilience”
Requested: 6 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$26,500/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

The active research faculty in LSU’s Department of Agricultural Economics and Agribusiness has produced a strong record of publication and secured substantial funding, focusing in particular on the economic development and environmental challenges facing Louisiana’s rural and coastal communities and the industries located in those areas. As has been previously noted, however, this program has failed to capitalize on those assets to attract U.S. applicants to a doctoral program that currently enrolls only 23 students. This has been the case for many years, and clearly a new approach is required if the department is to attract U.S. students, including under-represented minority students. There is no evidence of such an effort in this proposal. Although the plan put forward to develop a research initiative related to rural economic development and disaster resiliency in Louisiana is promising, this needs to be incorporated within a broad program of disciplinary training that will attract superior students. The proposal would also be enhanced by more explicit discussion of its potential impact on economic development. No funding is recommended.

005GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Graduate Fellows Board of Regents Proposal for the Marketing Department in the E. J. Ourso College of Business at Louisiana State University”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

This is a proposal to support the Ph.D. program in Marketing in the E. J. Ourso College of Business at LSU and A&M College. Unfortunately, the application submitted was not complete. This is a small program, currently enrolling only nine students (although data in the proposal are contradictory on this point) in a department that includes eight research-active faculty members. The information provided indicates that the program has had recent success in attracting increasing numbers of applicants, both from the United States (including some under-represented minority applicants) and internationally; however, basic enrollment data is entirely missing, as is evidence of faculty research productivity. Moreover, the proposal does not explain how BoRSF fellows would be recruited or how the fellowships would contribute to the continued development of a high-quality program. The relationship of the graduate program to the economic development of the State is not well defined. No funding is recommended.

006GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Graduate Fellowships in Biological Sciences at Louisiana State University and A&M College”
Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$120,000 TOTAL

This is a strong proposal from the high-quality Biological Sciences program at LSU and A&M College. The description of the doctoral program was thoughtful and wide ranging, though some parts seemed out of date. The proposal indicates a determination to promote a culture of mentoring, to watch carefully over student performance and to work hard to recruit students who contribute to diversity. The section describing the doctoral program was well written and entirely appropriate. The proposal also argues that putting BoRSF fellows with new faculty is a way to promote a rapid development of faculty careers. Despite these positive attributes, the department still appears to face some challenges. Over the last six years they have recruited about 160 students. The matriculants consisted of approximately 100 U.S. students, of which ten were under-represented minorities, along with about 60 international students. In three of the six years reported, however, the number of students who left the program exceeded the

number of matriculants. Even more troubling, of the ten under-represented minority students recruited, it appears that eight had left by last year without a degree. The situation for BoRSF fellows mirrors these results, though these numbers are so small as to render interpretation difficult. Of the twelve BoRSF fellows recruited in the last six years, two have graduated, two have dropped, and the rest are still in the program. The program is still of high quality and deserving of support, particularly given the focus on mentoring and student engagement. Funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$30,000 per year.

007GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Graduate Fellows Board of Regents Proposal for the Information Systems and Decision Sciences (ISDS) Department in the E. J. Ourso College of Business at Louisiana State University”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

The Department of Information Systems and Decision Sciences in the E. J. Ourso College of Business at LSU and A&M College supports a very small Ph.D. program. Unfortunately, the application for support was not complete. From the limited material provided, it appears that only one or two students apply each year. Nevertheless the department has been successful in graduating these students, including under-represented minority students, and placing them. This seems to be the product of careful tracking and monitoring, but in the absence of complete information it is impossible to be certain. In recent years the size of the faculty has declined sharply, making it more difficult to recruit highly qualified students. BoRSF fellowships could prove helpful in building an increased applicant pool, but this would need to be combined with a more ambitious recruitment strategy. The key to attracting applicants and building a program, however, will be faculty success in research and external funding. Again, no information is provided regarding faculty qualifications. It is also important that the department indicate the relationship between the program and economic development in Louisiana; no such information is included in the proposal. No funding is recommended.

008GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Graduate Fellowships in Chemistry for 2014”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$240,000 TOTAL

This is a very well presented application for two doctoral fellows from the Chemistry Department at LSU and A&M College – a department with a solid past, marked by considerable success in identifying and training under-represented minority doctoral students. Until recently this success has, to a degree, been accompanied by substantial attrition rates among all students. The current proposal outlines a number of good strategies to decrease the losses which have plagued the overall program for years and which now may have been successfully addressed for the BoRSF fellows. The data provided indicate substantial improvements over the attrition results of the preceding decade. Time to degree could still be improved as no BoRSF fellowship recipients appointed since 2006 have graduated. The PI indicates that she has played a major role in improving the doctoral program’s performance. In the graduate program overall, the program each year brings in around 20 U.S. nationals of which perhaps seven are under-represented minority students – a good result. Over the last six years, however, we also find that 37 U.S. nationals have graduated, while 33 left the program without the intended degree. Under-represented minority students have somewhat better experiences, with 18 graduated and 13 leaving the program over a six-year period. Funding is recommended for two four-year doctoral fellowships at \$30,000 each per year.

009GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Graduate Studies in Infectious Disease”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

LSU’s doctoral program in infectious disease performs a valuable service function for Louisiana. There are limited numbers of applicants to the doctoral program, and data show that 100% of those who receive an offer matriculate.

The reason for the small applicant pool seems to be that the program is marketed somewhat narrowly to people associated with veterinary medicine. The description of the program was somewhat superficial and amounted to an overview of material from the Graduate School, with no obvious details on student support, requirements for courses, or other program-specific information. The mentoring section similarly contained very little information. The program attracts approximately four U.S. students each year, and is limited to about 30 students on average. No funding is recommended.

010GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Earth, Ocean, and Environmental Sciences”
Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,000/annum for 4 years
4 Master’s-Level Fellowships at \$26,000/annum for 2 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$28,000/annum for 4 years
1 Master’s-Level Fellowship at \$24,000/annum for 2 years
TOTAL: \$160,000

The Departments of Oceanography & Coastal Sciences, Geology & Geophysics, and Environmental Sciences have developed a growing research and training collaboration in the area of environmental research, especially focusing on the coastal ecosystems. The departments collaborate in a new undergraduate major and in a Coastal Studies Institute established last year. Events of the last decade have put into relief the importance of research on coastal environments, and the proposal makes an effective case for the importance of the program and the research and training conducted within it to the economy of Louisiana. Faculty across the three disciplines have generally strong records in publication and in securing external funding, but only an estimated 8% of total funding provides support to students. There is a further concern that most of the grants listed in the current proposal appear to have expired. The proposal outlines a compelling list of research opportunities that should be attractive to well-qualified applicants, although the departure of substantial numbers of faculty is a cause for concern. A two-tier application process makes it difficult to judge how selective PhD admissions are, but the data suggest that the program is attracting a growing number of strong applicants. Particularly gratifying is the evidence that a special effort to recruit minority students has yielded increased numbers of applicants and that a number of these students have been accepted and enrolled. The panel felt that the requested stipend of \$26,000 was somewhat excessive for a master’s program in this field. Funding is therefore recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$28,000 per year and one two-year master’s fellowship at \$24,000 per year.

011GF-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Board of Regents Fellowships in Engineering 2014-19”
Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$360,000 TOTAL

The LSU College of Engineering has a well-funded, research-active faculty with approximately \$174,000 of extramural funding per faculty FTE. While the number of new proposal submissions appears to have dipped from the previous year, the portfolio funded by business and industry continues to grow. The focus for fellowships will be in the areas of energy, natural and built infrastructure, materials science and manufacturing. Thus, new fellowship recipients will be trained in areas of strategic importance to the college and economic development in the State. Nevertheless, it is unclear in the proposal exactly how fellowships will be distributed. The program is encouraged to do so by allocating support to the best applicants in the pool and/or in areas of highest strategic priority. The program has developed a set of satisfactory progress benchmarks that should help students stay on track for timely graduation and position them for success in a competitive job market. Attrition from the doctoral program remains relatively high and problematic, so the program is encouraged to continue to pay close attention to mentoring. While the number of domestic applicants has remained essentially the same over the past two years, a modest increase in the number of under-represented minority applicants is encouraging. The requirement that fellows participate in K-12 outreach activities that ask them to develop teaching activities aligned with grade-level student learning outcomes will well serve both K-12 students and future faculty. The importance of this program to the university and the college is evident in the significant institutional cost share. Funding is recommended for three four-year doctoral fellowships at \$30,000 per year.

012GF-14 **LSU HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER – NEW ORLEANS**
“Graduate Training in Integrative Pharmacology and Experimental Therapeutics”
Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$27,000/annum for 4 years = \$108,000 TOTAL

This is a proposal for fellowships in a small doctoral program with a modest research base. Admitting three to six new students per year to work with 19 faculty members, the program ensures a balanced faculty-to-student ratio. Undoubtedly this is one reason for what appears to be good doctoral completion rates. While the pharmaceutical industry might well be a major driver of economic development in Louisiana, the program does not seem to place an emphasis on connecting faculty to industry or preparing doctoral students to become either entrepreneurs or industry R&D scientists. Thus, the contributions of this program to Louisiana economic development are somewhat nebulous. A major challenge for the program is the very small U.S. applicant pool. Particularly discouraging is the fact that there have been no under-represented minority matriculants in the last three years and the program has not developed any creative new recruitment strategies to try to remedy this glaring deficiency. Nevertheless, this is a strong program and deserving of support. Funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$27,000 per year.

013GF-14 **LOUISIANA TECH UNIVERSITY**
“Superior Graduate Fellows Supporting Five Centers of Excellence in Engineering”
Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years = \$300,000 TOTAL

The connections between Louisiana Tech Engineering faculty, graduate students, and regional employers give clear evidence of the growing contributions of the programs and proposed fellowships to enhancing regional and statewide economic development. Furthermore, the STEM Education Research Center places a focus on the intersection of engineering and entrepreneurship and that, too, bodes well for future economic development endeavors. While the programs’ recruitment strategy of focusing on Louisiana Tech undergraduates, particularly those concurrently enrolled, has promise, the number of U.S. applicants to doctoral programs remains low, and in fact has grown smaller in the last two years, compared to the preceding four. This is particularly true for the continued under-representation of already under-represented students. The program is therefore encouraged to re-engineer its approach to recruiting, particularly to include use of some of the new social media tools. The program is to be commended, however, on the timely graduation of previous BoRSF fellows, which argues for the quality of mentoring across these programs. The university and its engineering programs are also to be commended for continuing to provide a stipend supplement despite lean economic times. Funding is recommended for three four-year doctoral fellowships at \$25,000 each per year.

014GF-14 **LOUISIANA TECH UNIVERSITY**
“Computational Analysis and Modeling Doctoral Graduate Fellows 2014-18”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$25,000/annum for 4 years = \$100,000 TOTAL

Computational Analysis and Modeling (CAM) is one of three doctoral programs in the College of Engineering and Science (COES) at Louisiana Tech. The innovative administrative structure of the university means that all graduate programs in the sciences and engineering are interdisciplinary. This is a real advantage. The program seems to do a remarkable job with the limited assets provided by the State. The well-documented impact on economic development describes activities of the college as a whole, rather than the specific program applying for support. It would have helped the panel to see a breakdown of the economic impact of this specific program separated from that of the college. In fact, most aspects of the CAM program are difficult to assess because much of the proposal narrative is devoted to COES as a whole and not specifically descriptive of this program. A general decline in applications is a concern, as is the lack of any under-represented minority applications last year (2011-12). On the positive side, GRE scores are good, and graduates are well placed in jobs. The numbers of female and minority students have significantly increased over the past decade, but the panel notes that no under-represented minority

students have graduated in the past six years. The \$5,000 supplement is a very positive feature of the proposal. Funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$25,000 per year.

015GF-14 NICHOLLS STATE UNIVERSITY
“Enhancement of Marine and Environmental Biology Student Recruitment through Graduate Study”
Requested: 3 Master’s-Level Fellowships at \$15,000/annum for 2 years

Recommended: 2 Master’s-Level Fellowships at \$15,000/annum for 2 years = \$60,000 TOTAL

During the last decade the Biological Sciences Department at Nicholls has built a successful regional master’s program in marine and environmental biology by capitalizing on a strategic location adjacent to the Barataria-Terrebonne National Estuary. A core of research-active faculty has had impressive success in publishing their work and acquiring external funding. Since the program was founded in 2002 the department has produced more than 50 master’s graduates. The proposal underscores the relationship between the program and regional economic development, citing links to area industries, including sugar, petroleum and fisheries, and the training of professionals to support these industries and various coastal and wetlands-related agencies and research facilities. The data presented indicate that departmental recruitment efforts have resulted in increased numbers of applicants, a greater degree of selectivity and higher enrollments. However, the department needs to take steps to attract under-represented minority candidates. The panel is pleased that the department has stopped its previous practice of combining verbal and quantitative GRE scores. Funding is recommended for two two-year master’s fellowships at \$15,000 each per year.

016GF-14 SOUTHERN UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“SUBR-MP Graduate Fellowship”
Requested: 4 Master’s-Level Fellowships at \$18,000/annum for 2 years

Recommended: - 0 -

While the recent departmental merger described in this proposal seems like a good development, there appear to be some problems still with the new department and its graduate program. The proposal indicates that two \$9,000 teaching assistantships per year are the only graduate support available to the department, which is inadequate. The idea of a master’s program that would help students transition to a doctoral program at another university appeals to the panel, but there are concerns that if BoRSF fellows are essentially the only funded students in the program, there would be too few superior peer students for healthy academic interaction. For a graduate program to be successful there must be a cohort of new students each year. NSF LAMP funding is mentioned, but it is unclear how this currently benefits or has benefitted the program. Data in the tables are incomplete and some of the numbers do not agree. There is little argument made for the economic impact of the program. The department does not seem to have national or regional prominence, and no evidence is given that superior graduate students can be recruited. No funding is recommended.

017GF-14 TULANE UNIVERSITY
“Recruitment and Mentoring of Superior Doctoral Students in Earth and Environmental Sciences at Tulane University”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years + \$1,000 fellowship increase in years 3 and 4

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$25,500/annum for 4 years = \$102,000 TOTAL

Tulane’s program in Earth and Environmental Sciences has a small, research-active faculty that has, consistent with Tulane’s mission, increasingly focused its efforts on questions related to coastal geology and those linked to the hydrocarbon industry. This focus is intended both to build the base of knowledge regarding questions that are crucial to the Louisiana economy and to train scholars and professionals to work in academe and in industry. This is a very small program with about 15 students, all of whom are supported (although there is limited fellowship funding). Appropriate to a program of this size, students appear to be closely tracked and mentored. The proposal might better have outlined plans for the development and growth of the program. The department appropriately sees the BoRSF

fellowships as a means to leverage more high-quality applicants; indeed, the number of applications has increased substantially in recent years, as has selectivity. However, the department has had very limited success in identifying potential under-represented minority students. The proposal outlines a creative and ambitious recruiting strategy, based on intense networking and reaching out to students prepared in disciplines other than geology. It is hoped that plans outlined to expand the pool of minority applicants will yield results. It is programmatically difficult to raise the fellowship award in years three and four, so funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$25,500 per year, rather than the \$25,000 requested in years one and two and \$26,000 in years three and four.

018GF-14 TULANE UNIVERSITY
“Recruiting Superior Graduate Students in Ecology and Evolutionary Biology”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$120,000 TOTAL

The Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology at Tulane is small and well funded. Graduate faculty take their mentoring responsibilities seriously and have an excellent program with remarkably low attrition. The time to degree is longer than expected for a program like this, for which the proposal cites the lingering effects of Hurricane Katrina. Indeed, no BoRSF fellow appointed since 2005, the year of Katrina, appears to have received the doctoral degree. Recruitment of under-represented minority students is limited, though the number of such applicants increased somewhat last year. In addition, last year two under-represented minority students matriculated, raising hope that a period of growth is beginning. The panel notes that the proposal still refers to a review/evaluation which occurred years before Katrina, and strongly recommends that this very dated reference be removed in future submissions. Given continuing issues with time to degree even eight years after Hurricane Katrina, the panel recommends funding for only one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$30,000 per year.

019GF-14 TULANE UNIVERSITY
“Recruiting Superior Graduate Students in Biomedical and Chemical & Biomolecular Engineering”
Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$120,000 TOTAL

This small but well-funded faculty has made a clear commitment to recruiting and supporting highly qualified and talented students. Faculty research is strongly linked to major State and regional workforce needs and to fostering the development of next-generation products and companies. The Bio-Innovation IGERT is clearly designed to give students the opportunity to develop the skills necessary to succeed in either academe or the private sector. Despite these very real strengths, however, the program continues to struggle with recruitment. Only one new under-represented minority student has joined the program in the last six years. While the many strategies to connect with Louisiana’s historically black colleges and universities make sense on the surface, they clearly are not working. The recruitment process needs to be totally rethought, perhaps in part to make use of the many new social media tools that are now available. Further, attrition rates are relatively high and require attention. In future proposals, the program needs to more clearly articulate the overall recruitment and funding strategy, especially the impact of BoRSF fellowships in relationship to the graduate student support available through the new IGERT program. Funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$30,000 per year.

020GF-14 TULANE UNIVERSITY
“Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Chemistry”
Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$240,000 TOTAL

This was a well-written and clearly explained proposal from Tulane’s Chemistry Department seeking three BoRSF fellows. The department appears to be strong, with rebuilding almost complete. Over the last few years five BoRSF fellows have graduated with doctoral degrees and one has left the program. Despite a rather small applicant pool, the program has recruited 29 U.S. students in six years, including three under-represented minority students. The selectivity of the program and degree yield data are less compelling; during the last six years 75% of students have

graduated and 25% have left the program. The program seems to be well designed and students are mentored carefully, though in traditional ways. While the program is small in size, its excellence is clear. Funding is recommended for two four-year doctoral fellowships at \$30,000 each per year.

021GF-14 TULANE UNIVERSITY
“Superior Graduate Students in Physics 2014-2019”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

As a result of Tulane’s post-Katrina reorganization, this small department is growing and seems to have achieved a desirable focus in materials science. Having a National Academy of Sciences member on the faculty is a major asset, as are several other award-winning faculty. The doctoral program, however, seems to have some challenges. In particular, student recruitment and funding are major issues. Recent U.S. matriculations have very low grade point averages (below 3.0) and in 2011 only one of eight U.S. candidates accepted. Recent years have shown a decline in the number of students in the program and the number of U.S. applicants is very low. Insufficient external funding may be an issue. Only six of ten faculty are funded and two of three PhD students are supported on teaching assistantships, far too high a ratio for a healthy program though an improvement over previous submissions. The program currently has no under-represented minority students and the last two to enroll left the program without the intended degree. On the positive side, there do seem to be activities in place that may help to recruit minority students in the future. The proposal is much improved from previous submissions, though there are still some inconsistencies. The claim of 90% retention is not supported by the data and numbers cited in the text do not always match those in the tables. If the program has a local economic impact beyond the undergraduate internships, grants received, and the work of one faculty member, it is not made explicit in the proposal. No funding is recommended.

022GF-14 TULANE UNIVERSITY
“Superior Graduate Students in Neuroscience / 2014-2019”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,500/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,500/annum for 4 years = \$228,000 TOTAL

Tulane’s interdepartmental/inter-college doctoral program in Neuroscience has a long history of support from the Board of Regents with seven of 28 current students supported by BoRSF fellowships. The program has been targeted for growth in the Tulane ten-year plan and several new faculty members have been added. It is of concern that only five of 28 students are supported on research grants, while 14 are on teaching assistantships. The reason for the low level of research assistantship funding is unclear. One possibility is that a disproportionate fraction of unfunded faculty members are mentoring neuroscience students; another is that faculty researchers are directing research assistantships for students in other programs while neuroscience students are funded by teaching assistantships. The panel strongly encourages the faculty to act on tentative plans to apply for training grants. Three of 28 students are categorized as being under-represented minorities, which is reasonable but not exceptional. The number of applications is adequate and slowly increasing. Overall, the program seems to be functioning well and is expected to grow in size and quality. The future looks bright if the student funding problem can be solved. Funding is recommended for two four-year doctoral fellowships at \$28,500 each per year.

023GF-14 TULANE UNIVERSITY HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER
“Global Impact of Interdisciplinary Graduate Training in Public Health Sciences”
Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,500/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$28,500/annum for 4 years = \$114,000 TOTAL

This proposal requests fellowships for an interdisciplinary doctoral program in public health based in TUHSC’s School of Public Health and Tropical Medicine. Participating departments include the Departments of Tropical Medicine and Global Community Health and Behavioral Sciences. The content areas for the proposed training program comprise basic biological principles in tropical medicine and infectious diseases, applications of principles in community health and behavioral sciences, which will form the basis for developing an interdisciplinary approach to studying public health aspects of infection, and disease prevention and control. Such an approach should have far-

reaching effects on a global scale. Throughout the program, approximately 30 faculty members are supported by significant national and international funding. This program will empower doctoral students by providing skills necessary to develop interdisciplinary approaches to public health issues, strengthening research capabilities and honing analytical thinking skills needed to find solutions to public health needs. Mentoring and outcomes are traditional. While this in itself is not unreasonable, outcomes are mixed over the last few years and a new approach may be needed. Of the four BoRSF fellows appointed in recent years, one has graduated, one has left the program and two are still in progress. More broadly, the program admits an average of five students each year from a small application pool, with a small yield of under-represented minority students. The program has graduated 17 students in the last six years, among them four under-represented minorities. On the other hand, 13 students have left the program, though seven of these occurred in the two years following Katrina and may have been hurricane-related. Given the strength of the program, the panel recommends funding for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$28,500 per year.

024GF-14 TULANE UNIVERSITY HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER
“Predoctoral Training in Biomedical Sciences”
Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,500/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$28,500/annum for 4 years = \$114,000 TOTAL

This proposal requests fellowship funding for the redesigned program in basic biomedical sciences at TUHSC. The move to an umbrella program seems to be progressing well. The program attracts approximately 160 applicants for a dozen positions each year, and the overall size of the graduate program averages around 60 students. There has been some success in recruiting under-represented minority students, likely a consequence of increased recruitment activities. The recruitment of qualified under-represented minority students to BoRSF fellowships is also much improved. The proposal reports that improved mentoring is leading to a shorter average time to degree, and the data provided seem to support this notion. Also a likely consequence of improved focus on mentoring is the much decreased level of attrition in recent years. In summary, this is an improved program on an upward trajectory. The panel was nevertheless concerned by the omission of key data. Table 11-GF was incomplete and the presentation of the proposal made it difficult to determine the level of current faculty funding and student support. A table summarizing this information in an easily digestible form will help considerably and can replace the excessively lengthy appendices. Funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$28,500 per year.

025GF-14 UNIVERSITY OF LOUISIANA AT LAFAYETTE
“Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Computer Science”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

UL Lafayette’s Computer Science and Computer Engineering graduate programs are combined under the umbrella of the Center for Advanced Computer Studies (CACS). The two programs together have 15 faculty members, 93 master’s students and 82 doctoral students. Problems with data tables make it impossible for the panel to get a clear picture of the doctoral program or understand program trends and success. For example, Table 9-GF has no data for the years 2003-2007; Table 12-GF does not account for all students (only 53 are shown as mentored) and does not show faculty publication activity or student support; and in Tables 10-GF and 11-GF the number of students entering the program does not correlate to those leaving (30 new students and 94 leaving by graduation or otherwise). The student completion rate does appear to be a major concern. The ratio of 51 graduations to 43 drops over the past six years is very high. Also of concern are the 28 students reported as unsupported in Table 11-GF; are these students working elsewhere? The proposal’s economic development section is very strong, indicating a commendable level of interaction with the local business community. There are no under-represented minority students currently enrolled in the PhD program and the most recent such students appear to have left without the intended degree. This suggests a lack of commitment to this important dimension of graduate student training. No funding is recommended.

026GF-14 UNIVERSITY OF LOUISIANA AT LAFAYETTE
“Recruiting Superior PhD Students in Systems Engineering”
Requested: 5 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$24,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

This new doctoral program builds on the strength and track record of a successful master’s program and currently enrolls 24 students. The proposal speaks to the program’s connection between the design-based problem-solving approach and how students’ work will address local industry needs. The fact that preference will be given to students with some previous industrial experience also enhances the potential that graduate fellows’ educational and research interests will lead to increased economic development for the State and the region. Because the program is new, it is difficult to evaluate how successful the proposed recruitment strategies will be. Despite healthy enrollments in the first year of operation, the U.S. applicant pool for the most recent year reported was modest, possibly suggesting that early enrollment success stemmed from “pent-up demand” from already-enrolled master’s students. The program should continue to pay close attention to the effectiveness of recruitment as well as to strategies for increasing the yield (i.e., the percent of those accepted who actually matriculate). Of particular concern is the fact that virtually all of the extramural funding listed in the tables expired in 2012. Without grant funding to support incoming cohorts of doctoral students, the future of the program is uncertain. While it is clear the progress of fellowship recipients will be closely monitored, it is perhaps unreasonable to create a policy that terminates the fellowship if a student’s grade point average falls below 3.25 or if the research advisor deems progress inadequate. A support mechanism should be put in place to identify early in their graduate studies students who may be struggling, so that interventions and support can be put in place prior to the termination of the fellowship. At \$24,000 per year, the proposed stipend is low and the panel questions whether it is sufficient for the program to be nationally competitive for the best students. No funding is recommended.

027GF-14 UNIVERSITY OF LOUISIANA AT LAFAYETTE
“BoRSF Graduate Fellowships for the Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students into the Doctor of Nursing Practice (DNP) Program”
Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$35,000/annum for 2 years

Recommended: - 0 -

This new, fully online Doctor of Nursing Practice (DNP) program is designed to meet the demand for advanced practice nurses across the region and the State. Certainly doctorally prepared nurses will meet a critical health care manpower need. However, it is less clear how the DNP program and degree recipients will “meet the goal to create new products and services in health care, consistent with the Louisiana economic development plan.” It is possible that the program could accomplish this, but the primary weakness of the current proposal is that it does not address how the research, education, or service of proposed fellowship holders would be aligned with these goals. Likewise, it is unclear how students enrolled in an online program would be included in faculty research projects in such a way as to advance the performance of the department. Again, it is possible that they could do so, but the mechanisms are not specified. Instead, the fellowships seemed designed to attract employed nurses into full-time study. Even at \$35,000 a year – far higher than fellowships in any other field – it is questionable whether the stipend will be enough to compensate for surrendering paid employment. No funding is recommended.

028GF-14 UNIVERSITY OF LOUISIANA AT LAFAYETTE
“Recruiting Superior PhD Students in Environmental and Evolutionary Biology for 2014”
Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$28,000/annum for 4 years = \$112,000 TOTAL

UL Lafayette’s program in Environmental and Evolutionary Biology has emerged as one of the most prominent and well-regarded in the region. Building on strong relationships with nearby federal labs, the program has developed an impressive research record by capitalizing on assets associated with Louisiana’s distinctive ecology and environment. Recently, the program has taken the lead in pursuing research on the Gulf of Mexico oil spill. The proposal makes a strong case for the impact of the program on economic development in terms of both these research activities and more general workforce development. Faculty members have strong records of publication.

There is continuing concern, however, that although external funding is robust, a substantial number of faculty members do not have funding. The department has made very effective use of the BoRSF fellowships to increase the pool of highly qualified applicants and admissions have become more competitive. The proposal provides indications of innovative recruiting strategies. The link with the SREB program to attract under-represented minority students seems to have been successful and minority enrollments in the program are impressive. The low level of student support is a continuing concern and may explain in part high levels of attrition in recent years. It is encouraging to see that the department has studied the problem and has begun to institute new approaches to recruitment and mentoring that should improve retention. The plan to automatically remove fellowship students whose grade point average falls below 3.5 may not be consistent with an effective mentoring strategy and should be reconsidered. Funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$28,000 per year.

029GF-14 UNIVERSITY OF LOUISIANA AT LAFAYETTE
“Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Mathematics for Doctoral Program”
Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

This proposal paints a picture of a program struggling due to lack of internal and external funding. Only nine of 21 graduate faculty members mentor PhD students. The ratio of graduations to drops is high (23 graduations/45 drops over the six years shown). Data tables seem to be inconsistent; admissions data provided in Table 10-GF do not show enough new students to account for the number of graduates and drops shown in Table 11-GF. GRE scores for newly admitted students are quite high, but some undergraduate grade point averages are extremely low, suggesting admissions decisions are often based entirely on GRE scores. The pool of quality applicants appears to be too small, though a recent increase in the number of applications by under-represented minority students suggests some progress in this area. Economic development activities appear limited. No funding is recommended.

030GF-14 UNIVERSITY OF NEW ORLEANS
“Graduate Fellowships in Integrative Biology at the University of New Orleans”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$31,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$120,000 TOTAL

This proposal requests fellowships to support the newly reconstituted Integrative Biology doctoral program at UNO. From its inception in 1999, UNO’s biological sciences doctoral programs have suffered from a lack of alignment between the faculty and a programmatic focus on conservation biology, a problem recognized by this panel in the past. The shift to integrative biology should permit participation from all research-active faculty members and thus facilitate an increase in the number of program applications, which has been quite small. BoRSF fellowships could help leverage a larger number of applicants and help to stabilize the program. The sharp decline in the size of the faculty, however, is a serious concern, as is the small number of doctoral students supported on external funds. The proposal outlines a thoughtful plan for recruitment and mentoring, and the department has a strong record of retaining doctoral students. The program has had limited success in attracting under-represented minority applicants, and the data presented on minority enrollments are inconsistent. The relatively small faculty has an impressive record of publication and has attracted substantial external funding; that fewer than half of the members of the department have funding, however, is cause for concern. The requested fellowship level of \$31,000 is not consistent with national standards and not well justified. Funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$30,000 per year.

031GF-14 UNIVERSITY OF NEW ORLEANS
“Graduate Fellowships for the Chemistry Doctoral Program at the University of New Orleans”
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$31,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$120,000 TOTAL

UNO’s Chemistry doctoral program is small, consisting of ten faculty members, approximately 50 students and a significant amount of funding from the federal and State sources. The panel notes with concern that a significant

amount of this funding ends in 2013. The training program is very traditional for a chemistry department; however, the data show a low attrition rate, indicating that the faculty is actively addressing student needs. In fact, in this regard, the program is exemplary. The program also shows success in recruiting a diverse student population. As evidenced by the submitted data, time to degree averages approximately five years. Overall, however, this is a small program with a limited applicant pool. The program has made good use of available resources and has shown success in graduate training. The number of faculty in the department has recently declined significantly and the proposal notes that this trend is unlikely to be reversed in the immediate future. This raises the issue of how long such a small group can maintain this successful graduate program along with all their other faculty responsibilities. In future applications this issue needs to be discussed, especially in terms of the impact on graduate training. The requested fellowship level of \$31,000 is not consistent with national standards and not well justified. Funding is recommended for one four-year doctoral fellowship at \$30,000 per year.

001GFT-14 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE
“Improving Classroom Interest in Science and Mathematics by Preparing Highly Qualified Teacher”
Requested: 6 Master’s-Level Fellowships at \$20,000/annum for 1 year

Recommended: 4 Master’s-Level Fellowships at \$20,000/annum for 1 year = \$80,000 TOTAL

Clearly, the need to increase the number of well-qualified licensed mathematics and science teachers is crucial to the State of Louisiana and the nation. LSU’s Holmes Program clearly addresses these needs, and provides an important pipeline of STEM teachers to Louisiana classrooms. It is very difficult, however, from this proposal to tell just how much success LSU’s Holmes Program is having in recruiting students in STEM, since data report applicants for all master’s concentrations in the program. Similarly, it is difficult to determine how many under-represented minority students are admitted to the School of Education in general and then to the science and math education programs in particular. This gives cause for concern, coupled with the fact that it appears that the two fellowship positions awarded in FY 2010-11 have not been filled and that there was a large drop in the number of new degree recipients in 2011-12. The proposal does not speak directly to ways in which fellowship recipients will enhance the stature and performance of the program. It also would be helpful to include an assessment of 1) the impact of BoR fellowships in recruiting students who otherwise would not have applied to or matriculated in the Holmes program; 2) whether BoRSF fellowship recipients become more effective teachers than those coming into science and mathematics teaching through other pathways; and 3) the percentage of BoRSF fellows still teaching in Louisiana. Data seem to indicate that a non-trivial number of BoRSF fellows fail to complete the period of teaching required by the fellowship, so it is important for program leaders to consider what kinds of early career support they could provide to enhance retention of first- and second-year math and science teachers. Despite these misgivings, the panel believes in the value of the Holmes Program and recommends support for four one-year master’s-level fellowships at \$20,000 each.

APPENDIX C

LISTS OF PROPOSALS SUBMITTED

**Traditional Graduate Fellows Program
2012-13 Competition
Proposals Submitted**

Proposal#/ Discipline	PI Name(s)	Institution	Proposal Title	Duration	Funds Requested
001GF-14 MATH	William Adkins	LSU-Baton Rouge	Recruitment of Superior Doctoral Students in Mathematics	4 years 4 PhD @ \$27K	Y1: \$108,000 Y2: \$108,000 Y3: \$108,000 <u>Y4: \$108,000</u> Total: \$432,000
002GF-14 PHYS	Dana Browne	LSU-Baton Rouge	Graduate Fellows in Physics and Astronomy	4 years 4 PhD @ \$29K	Y1: \$116,000 Y2: \$116,000 Y3: \$116,000 <u>Y4: \$116,000</u> Total: \$464,000
003GF-14 EDU	Renee Casbergue	LSU-Baton Rouge	Early childhood graduate fellowship: Investigating teacher-child language in preschool centers	4 years 1 PhD @ \$25K	Y1: \$25,000 Y2: \$25,000 Y3: \$25,000 <u>Y4: \$25,000</u> Total: \$100,000
004GF-14 AG	Joshua Detre	LSU-Baton Rouge	Recruitment of Superior Doctoral Students in Rural and Coastal Resilience	4 years 6 PhD @ \$26.5K	Y1: \$159,000 Y2: \$159,000 Y3: \$159,000 <u>Y4: \$159,000</u> Total: \$636,000
005GF-14 BUS	Judith Folsie	LSU-Baton Rouge	Graduate Fellows Board of Regents Proposal for the Marketing Department in the E. J. Ourso College of Business at Louisiana State University	4 years 2 PhD @ \$25K	Y1: \$50,000 Y2: \$50,000 Y3: \$50,000 <u>Y4: \$50,000</u> Total: \$200,000

006GF-14 BIO	Michael Hellberg	LSU-Baton Rouge	Graduate Fellowships in Biological Sciences at Louisiana State University and A&M College	4 years 4 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$120,000 Y2: \$120,000 Y3: \$120,000 <u>Y4: \$120,000</u> Total: \$480,000
007GF-14 CIS	Rudolf Hirschheim	LSU-Baton Rouge	Graduate Fellows Board of Regents Proposal for the Information Systems and Decision Sciences (ISDS) Department in the E. J. Ourso College of Business at Louisiana State University	4 years 2 PhD @ \$25K	Y1: \$50,000 Y2: \$50,000 Y3: \$50,000 <u>Y4: \$50,000</u> Total: \$200,000
008GF-14 CHEM	Carol Taylor	LSU-Baton Rouge	Graduate Fellowships in Chemistry for 2014	4 years 2 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$60,000 Y2: \$60,000 Y3: \$60,000 <u>Y4: \$60,000</u> Total: \$240,000
009GF-14 HM	Ronald Thune	LSU-Baton Rouge	Graduate Studies in Infectious Disease	4 years 2 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$60,000 Y2: \$60,000 Y3: \$60,000 <u>Y4: \$60,000</u> Total: \$240,000
010GF-14 EARTH	Robert Turner	LSU-Baton Rouge	Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Earth, Ocean, and Environmental Sciences	4 years/2 years 4 PhD @ \$28K 4 MS @ \$26K	Y1: \$164,000 Y2: \$164,000 Y3: \$164,000 <u>Y4: \$164,000</u> Total: \$656,000

011GF-14 ENG	Warren Waggenspack, Jr.	LSU-Baton Rouge	Board of Regents Fellowships in Engineering 2014-19	4 years 3 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$90,000 Y2: \$90,000 Y3: \$90,000 <u>Y4: \$90,000</u> Total: \$360,000
012GF-14 BIO	Andrew Catling	LSUHSC-NO	Graduate Training in Integrative Pharmacology and Experimental Therapeutics	4 years 3 PhD @ \$27K	Y1: \$81,000 Y2: \$81,000 Y3: \$81,000 <u>Y4: \$81,000</u> Total: \$324,000
013GF-14 ENG	James Palmer	LA Tech University	Superior Graduate Fellows Supporting Five Centers of Excellence in Engineering	4 years 4 PhD @ \$25K	Y1: \$100,000 Y2: \$100,000 Y3: \$100,000 <u>Y4: \$100,000</u> Total: \$400,000
014GF-14 MATH	Bala Ramachandran	LA Tech University	Computational Analysis and Modeling Doctoral Graduate Fellows 2014-18	4 years 2 PhD @ \$25K	Y1: \$50,000 Y2: \$50,000 Y3: \$50,000 <u>Y4: \$50,000</u> Total: \$200,000
015GF-14 BIO	Aaron Pierce	Nicholls State University	Enhancement of Marine and Environmental Biology Student Recruitment through Graduate Study	2 years 3 MS @ \$15K	Y1: \$45,000 <u>Y2: \$45,000</u> Total: \$90,000
016GF-14 MATH	Humberto Munoz Barona	SUBR	SUBR-MP Graduate Fellowship	2 years 4 MS @ \$18K	Y1: \$72,000 <u>Y2: \$72,000</u> Total: \$144,000

017GF-14 EARTH	Nancye Dawers	Tulane University	Recruitment and Mentoring of Superior Doctoral Students in Earth and Environmental Sciences at Tulane University	4 years 2 PhD @ \$25K + \$1K increase in Y3-4	Y1: \$50,000 Y2: \$50,000 Y3: \$52,000 <u>Y4: \$52,000</u> Total: \$204,000
018GF-14 BIO	Elizabeth Derryberry	Tulane University	Recruiting Superior Graduate Students in Ecology and Evolutionary Biology	4 years 2 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$60,000 Y2: \$60,000 Y3: \$60,000 <u>Y4: \$60,000</u> Total: \$240,000
019GF-14 ENG	Anne Robinson	Tulane University	Recruiting Superior Graduate Students in Biomedical and Chemical & Biomolecular Engineering	4 years 4 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$120,000 Y2: \$120,000 Y3: \$120,000 <u>Y4: \$120,000</u> Total: \$480,000
020GF-14 CHEM	Russell Schmehl	Tulane University	Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Chemistry	4 years 3 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$90,000 Y2: \$90,000 Y3: \$90,000 <u>Y4: \$90,000</u> Total: \$360,000
021GF-14 PHYS	Jerry Shakov	Tulane University	Superior Graduate Students in Physics 2014-2019	4 years 2 PhD @ \$28K	Y1: \$56,000 Y2: \$56,000 Y3: \$56,000 <u>Y4: \$56,000</u> Total: \$224,000

022GF-14 HM	Jeffrey Tasker	Tulane University	Superior Graduate Students in Neuroscience / 2014-2019	4 years 2 PhD @ \$28.5K	Y1: \$57,000 Y2: \$57,000 Y3: \$57,000 <u>Y4: \$57,000</u> Total: \$228,000
023GF-14 HM	Geetha Bansal	TUHSC	Global Impact of Interdisciplinary Graduate Training in Public Health Sciences	4 years 4 PhD @ \$28.5K	Y1: \$114,000 Y2: \$114,000 Y3: \$114,000 <u>Y4: \$114,000</u> Total: \$456,000
024GF-14 BIO	Robert Garry	TUHSC	Predocctoral Training in Biomedical Sciences	4 years 4 PhD @ \$28.5K	Y1: \$114,000 Y2: \$114,000 Y3: \$114,000 <u>Y4: \$114,000</u> Total: \$456,000
025GF-14 CIS	Magdy Bayoumi	University of Louisiana at Lafayette	Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Computer Science	4 years 2 PhD @ \$27K	Y1: \$54,000 Y2: \$54,000 Y3: \$54,000 <u>Y4: \$54,000</u> Total: \$216,000
026GF-14 ENG	Afef Fekih	University of Louisiana at Lafayette	Recruiting Superior PhD Students in Systems Engineering	4 years 5 PhD @ \$24K	Y1: \$120,000 Y2: \$120,000 Y3: \$120,000 <u>Y4: \$120,000</u> Total: \$480,000
027GF-14 HM	Helen Hurst	University of Louisiana at Lafayette	BoRSF Graduate Fellowships for the Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students into the Doctor of Nursing Practice (DNP) Program	2 years 3 PhD @ \$35K	Y1: \$105,000 <u>Y2: \$105,000</u> Total: \$210,000

028GF-14 BIO	Paul Klerks	University of Louisiana at Lafayette	Recruiting Superior PhD Students in Environmental and Evolutionary Biology for 2014	4 years 3 PhD @ \$28K	Y1: \$84,000 Y2: \$84,000 Y3: \$84,000 <u>Y4: \$84,000</u> Total: \$336,000
029GF-14 MATH	Arturo Magidin	University of Louisiana at Lafayette	Recruitment of superior graduate students in Mathematics for Doctoral Program	4 years 3 PhD @ \$28K	Y1: \$84,000 Y2: \$84,000 Y3: \$84,000 <u>Y4: \$84,000</u> Total: \$336,000
030GF-14 BIO	Bernard Rees	University of New Orleans	Graduate Fellowships in Integrative Biology at the University of New Orleans	4 years 2 PhD @ \$31K	Y1: \$62,000 Y2: \$62,000 Y3: \$62,000 <u>Y4: \$62,000</u> Total: \$248,000
031GF-14 CHEM	John Wiley	University of New Orleans	Graduate Fellowships for the Chemistry Doctoral Program at the University of New Orleans	4 years 2 PhD @ \$31K	Y1: \$62,000 Y2: \$62,000 Y3: \$62,000 <u>Y4: \$62,000</u> Total: \$248,000

TRADITIONAL GRADUATE FELLOWS PROPOSAL SUBMISSION SUMMARY

NUMBER SUBMITTED: 31

Agriculture: 1	Education: 1
Biological Sciences: 7	Engineering A&B: 4
Business: 1	Health & Medical Sciences: 4
Chemistry: 3	Mathematics: 4
Computer & Information Sciences: 2	Physics/Astronomy: 2
Earth/Environmental Sciences: 2	

FIRST-YEAR FUNDS REQUESTED: \$2,582,000

TOTAL FUNDS REQUESTED: \$9,888,000

TOTAL FIRST-YEAR FUNDS AVAILABLE: \$720,000

**Graduate Fellowships for Teachers Program
2012-13 Competition
Proposals Submitted**

Proposal#/ Discipline	PI Name(s)	Institution	Proposal Title	Duration	Funds Requested
001GFT-14 ED	Byron Launey	LSU-BR	Improving Classroom Interest in Science and Mathematics by Preparing Highly Qualified Teacher	1 year 6 MS @ \$20K	\$120,000

GRADUATE FELLOWSHIPS FOR TEACHERS PROPOSAL SUBMISSION SUMMARY

NUMBER SUBMITTED: 1

TOTAL FUNDS REQUESTED: \$120,000

TOTAL FIRST-YEAR FUNDS AVAILABLE: \$180,000